

# Creating an R data set from STAR

Douglas Bates  
Department of Statistics  
University of Wisconsin – Madison

April 5, 2005

## Abstract

A substantial portion of the data from Tennessee's Student Teacher Achievement Ratio (STAR) project, a large-scale, four-year study of reduced class size, has been made available to the public at <http://www.heros-inc.org/data.htm>. We describe the creation of an R (<http://www.r-project.org>) data set from these data.

## 1 Introduction

The data from the STAR project are available in several different forms from the web site <http://www.heros-inc.org/data.htm>. The most convenient form for creation of an R data set is the tab-delimited text file. Download and unzip the archive file <http://www.heros-inc.org/ascii-star.zip> producing two files: `readme.txt`, a description of the data, and `webstar.txt`, the data themselves.

## 2 Reading the data

From the data description file we can see that there are 53 columns in the data set and most of these columns are coded values. Such columns should be represented as factors in R but many of these columns will need to be combined before we can work with them. We will convert the first 5 columns to factors and leave the remaining 48 columns as integers.

```
orig <- read.table("webstar.txt", header = TRUE,  
                  colCl = rep(c("factor", "integer"), c(5, 48)))
```

In the call to `read.table` we used an explicit file name for the data file. In practice it is often more convenient to use the `file.choose` function which brings up a file chooser panel.

We can check the form of the original data with

```
> str(orig)
```

```

`data.frame':      11598 obs. of  53 variables:
 $ NEWID   : Factor w/ 11598 levels "100017","100028",...: 839 943 986 1104 1263 1346 1485 15
 $ SSEX    : Factor w/ 3 levels "1","2","9": 2 2 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 ...
 $ SRACE   : Factor w/ 7 levels "1","2","3","4",...: 2 1 2 1 2 1 2 1 1 1 ...
 $ SBIRTHQ : Factor w/ 5 levels "1","2","3","4",...: 3 1 4 4 1 3 1 4 2 3 ...
 $ SBIRTHY : Factor w/ 7 levels "1977","1978",...: 3 4 3 3 4 3 3 3 3 3 ...
 $ STARK   : int    2 1 1 2 1 2 2 2 2 2 ...
 $ STAR1   : int    2 1 1 2 2 2 2 1 1 1 ...
 $ STAR2   : int    2 1 1 2 2 1 2 1 1 1 ...
 $ STAR3   : int    1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 ...
 $ CLYPEK  : int    9 1 1 9 3 9 9 9 9 9 ...
 $ CLYPE1  : int    9 1 1 9 9 9 9 3 2 2 ...
 $ CLYPE2  : int    9 1 3 9 9 2 9 3 2 2 ...
 $ CLYPE3  : int    2 1 3 1 9 2 3 3 2 2 ...
 $ SCHYPEK : int    9 3 2 9 1 9 9 9 9 9 ...
 $ HDEGK   : int    9 2 2 9 2 9 9 9 9 9 ...
 $ CLADK   : int    9 1 1 9 6 9 9 9 9 9 ...
 $ TOTEXPK : int    99 7 21 99 0 99 99 99 99 99 ...
 $ TRACEK  : int    9 1 1 9 1 9 9 9 9 9 ...
 $ TREADSSK: int    999 447 450 999 439 999 999 999 999 ...
 $ TMATHSSK: int    999 473 536 999 463 999 999 999 999 ...
 $ SESK    : int    9 2 2 9 1 9 9 9 9 9 ...
 $ SCHYPE1 : int    9 3 2 9 9 9 9 3 3 3 ...
 $ TRACE1  : int    9 1 2 9 9 9 9 1 1 1 ...
 $ HDEG1   : int    9 1 2 9 9 9 9 2 2 1 ...
 $ CLAD1   : int    9 4 3 9 9 9 9 2 4 4 ...
 $ TOTEXP1 : int    99 7 32 99 99 99 99 8 13 7 ...
 $ TREADSS1: int    999 507 579 999 999 999 999 475 999 651 ...
 $ TMATHSS1: int    999 538 592 999 999 999 999 512 999 532 ...
 $ SES1    : int    9 1 9 9 9 9 9 2 2 2 ...
 $ SCHYPE2 : int    9 3 2 9 9 3 9 3 3 3 ...
 $ TRACE2  : int    9 1 2 9 9 1 9 2 1 1 ...
 $ HDEG2   : int    9 1 1 9 9 1 9 2 1 1 ...
 $ CLAD2   : int    9 2 4 9 9 1 9 4 4 4 ...
 $ TOTEXP2 : int    99 3 4 99 99 13 99 13 6 8 ...
 $ TREADSS2: int    999 568 588 999 999 999 999 573 999 596 ...
 $ TMATHSS2: int    999 579 579 999 999 999 999 550 999 590 ...
 $ SES2    : int    9 2 2 9 9 2 9 2 2 2 ...
 $ SCHYPE3 : int    2 3 2 3 9 3 1 3 3 3 ...
 $ TREADSS3: int    580 587 644 686 999 644 999 599 999 626 ...
 $ TMATHSS3: int    564 593 639 667 999 648 999 583 999 618 ...
 $ SES3    : int    1 1 2 2 9 2 1 2 2 2 ...
 $ TRACE3  : int    1 1 1 1 9 1 2 1 1 1 ...
 $ HDEG3   : int    1 1 1 1 9 1 1 1 1 2 ...
 $ CLAD3   : int    4 2 4 4 9 4 1 6 4 4 ...
 $ TOTEXP3 : int    30 1 4 10 99 15 17 23 8 8 ...

```

```

$ SYSIDKN : int  999 30 11 999 11 999 999 999 999 999 ...
$ SYSID1N : int  999 30 11 999 999 999 999 4 40 21 ...
$ SYSID2N : int  999 30 11 999 999 6 999 4 40 21 ...
$ SYSID3N : int  22 30 11 6 999 6 11 4 40 21 ...
$ SCHIDKN : int  999 63 20 999 19 999 999 999 999 999 ...
$ SCHID1N : int  999 63 20 999 999 999 999 5 77 50 ...
$ SCHID2N : int  999 63 20 999 999 8 999 5 77 50 ...
$ SCHID3N : int  54 63 20 8 999 8 31 5 77 50 ...

```

## 2.1 Missing value codes

All the columns except the first column have missing values present. Typically the missing value code is "9" but "99", "999" and "9999" are also used. We convert these to R's missing value code NA column by column.

```

> mv <- rep("9", 53)
> mv[c(4, 17, 26, 34, 45)] <- "99"
> mv[c(19, 20, 27, 28, 35, 36, 39, 40, 46:53)] <- "999"
> mv[5] <- "9999"
> mv[1] <- "999999"
> for (i in seq(a = orig)) orig[[i]][orig[[i]] == mv[i]] <- NA
> summary(orig[1:5])

```

|          | NEWID | SSEX     | SRACE       | SBIRTHQ  |
|----------|-------|----------|-------------|----------|
| 100017 : | 1     | 1 :6122  | 1 :7193     | 1 :2836  |
| 100028 : | 1     | 2 :5456  | 2 :4173     | 2 :2851  |
| 100045 : | 1     | 9 : 0    | 3 : 32      | 3 :3422  |
| 100064 : | 1     | NA's: 20 | 4 : 21      | 4 :2423  |
| 100070 : | 1     |          | 6 : 20      | 99 : 0   |
| 100096 : | 1     |          | (Other): 14 | NA's: 66 |
| (Other): | 11592 |          | NA's : 145  |          |
| SBIRTHY  |       |          |             |          |
| 1980 :   | 6886  |          |             |          |
| 1979 :   | 3915  |          |             |          |
| 1978 :   | 645   |          |             |          |
| 1977 :   | 58    |          |             |          |
| 1981 :   | 24    |          |             |          |
| (Other): | 1     |          |             |          |
| NA's :   | 69    |          |             |          |

Notice that level "9" is still present for the SSEX variable even after all the observations at that level have been replaced by the missing value code. To remove these unused levels from this and all the other columns, we loop over the columns selecting all the values but using the optional argument `drop = TRUE`.

```

> for (i in seq(a = orig)) orig[[i]] <- orig[[i]][drop = TRUE]
> summary(orig[1:5])

```

| NEWID   |   | SSEX |       | SRACE |       | SBIRTHQ |       | SBIRTHY |
|---------|---|------|-------|-------|-------|---------|-------|---------|
| 100017  | : | 1    | 1     | :6122 | 1     | :7193   | 1     | :2836   |
| 1977    | : |      |       |       |       |         |       | 58      |
| 100028  | : | 1    | 2     | :5456 | 2     | :4173   | 2     | :2851   |
| 1978    | : |      |       |       |       |         |       | 645     |
| 100045  | : | 1    | NA's: | 20    | 3     | :32     | 3     | :3422   |
| 1979    | : |      |       |       |       |         |       | 3915    |
| 100064  | : | 1    |       |       | 4     | :21     | 4     | :2423   |
| 1980    | : |      |       |       |       |         |       | 6886    |
| 100070  | : | 1    |       |       | 5     | :14     | NA's: | 66      |
| 1981    | : |      |       |       |       |         |       | 24      |
| 100096  | : | 1    |       |       | 6     | :20     |       |         |
| 1982    | : |      |       |       |       |         |       | 1       |
| (Other) | : |      |       |       | NA's: |         |       | 145     |
| 11592   | : |      |       |       |       |         |       | 69      |

For convenience we convert the names of the columns to lower case.

```
> names(orig) <- tolower(names(orig))
```

### 3 Setting factor levels

In R the levels of a factor can be given meaningful labels instead of numeric codes and in most cases this eliminates the need for a separate codebook. For example storing the labels of `sex` as "M" and "F" makes the coding self-explanatory. When used in a model a factor is automatically converted to a set of “contrasts” (there is a technical definition of the term “contrast” in linear models that is not always fulfilled by these derived variables) and the corresponding coefficients are given meaningful names.

When there is a natural ordering of the levels of a factor it can be created as an ordered factor that will preserve this ordering.

The labels can be set after the factor is created or as part of the creation of the factor. Below we will create a “long form” of the data where each row corresponds to a combination of student and grade. In doing this we will need to concatenate related columns of the original data frame. For example, the columns `cltypek`, `cltype1`, `cltype2` and `cltype3` will be concatenated to form a single column `cltype`. If the coding is consistent across the grades then it is easiest to concatenate the integer codes and set the labels on the “long” version of the variable.

However there are two groups of variables, `hdeg` and `clad`, that are not coded consistently. In each case the codes used for kindergarten teachers are different from those used for teachers of grades 1 to 3 classes. The codes for kindergarten teachers are a superset of those for the other teachers but the numbering is not consistent; a bachelor's degree is coded as 2 for kindergarten but 1 for the others. Thus we cannot combine the numeric values - we must create the labels for each column and then concatenate the labels and convert to a factor.

```
> orig$hdegk <- ordered(orig$hdegk, levels = 1:6, labels = c("ASSOC",
+ "BS/BA", "MS/MA/MEd", "MA+", "Ed.S", "Ed.D/Ph.D"))
> orig$hdeg1 <- ordered(orig$hdeg1, levels = 1:4, labels = c("BS/BA",
+ "MS/MA/MEd", "Ed.S", "Ed.D/Ph.D"))
> orig$hdeg2 <- ordered(orig$hdeg2, levels = 1:4, labels = c("BS/BA",
+ "MS/MA/MEd", "Ed.S", "Ed.D/Ph.D"))
```

```

> orig$hdeg3 <- ordered(orig$hdeg3, levels = 1:4, labels = c("BS/BA",
+ "MS/MA/MEd", "Ed.S", "Ed.D/Ph.D"))
> orig$cladk <- factor(orig$cladk, levels = c(1:3, 5:8),
+ labels = c("1", "2", "3", "APPR", "PROB", "NOT",
+ "PEND"))
> orig$clad1 <- factor(orig$clad1, levels = 1:6, labels = c("NOT",
+ "APPR", "PROB", "1", "2", "3"))
> orig$clad2 <- factor(orig$clad2, levels = 1:6, labels = c("NOT",
+ "APPR", "PROB", "1", "2", "3"))
> orig$clad3 <- factor(orig$clad3, levels = 1:6, labels = c("NOT",
+ "APPR", "PROB", "1", "2", "3"))

```

## 4 Creating separate data frames

These data are represented in a “wide” format where each row corresponds to a student. Some of the columns, such as `ssex`, are indeed a property of the student; some, such as `hdegk` are properties of teachers; some, such as `sctypek` are properties of schools or classes in schools; and some are unique to a student/grade combination. We will create separate frames for each of these types.

The first 5 columns are student-level data

```

> student <- orig[1:5]
> names(student) <- c("id", "sx", "eth", "birthq", "birthy")
> levels(student$sx) <- c("M", "F")
> levels(student$eth) <- c("W", "B", "A", "H", "I", "O")
> student$birthy <- ordered(student$birthy)
> student$birthq <- ordered(paste(student$birthy, student$birthq,
+ sep = ":"))
> summary(student)

```

|               | id | sx       | eth       | birthq       | birthy    |
|---------------|----|----------|-----------|--------------|-----------|
| 100017 :      | 1  | M :6122  | W :7193   | 1980:3 :2304 | 1977: 58  |
| 100028 :      | 1  | F :5456  | B :4173   | 1980:1 :2221 | 1978: 645 |
| 100045 :      | 1  | NA's: 20 | A : 32    | 1980:2 :2190 | 1979:3915 |
| 100064 :      | 1  |          | H : 21    | 1979:4 :1879 | 1980:6886 |
| 100070 :      | 1  |          | I : 14    | 1979:3 : 923 | 1981: 24  |
| 100096 :      | 1  |          | O : 20    | 1979:2 : 586 | 1982: 1   |
| (Other):11592 |    |          | NA's: 145 | (Other):1495 | NA's: 69  |

The other columns refer to a combination of the student and grade. We first create an expanded or “long” version of the table with a row for each student/grade combination.

To create the long version of the table we repeat the student ids four times and add a column for the grade level. Related groups of columns, such as `cltypek`, `cltype1`, `cltype2` and `cltype3`, are concatenated then converted to a factor. However, there are two groups, `hdeg` and `clad`, for which this approach will not work because these groups are not encoded consistently.

```

> long <- data.frame(id = rep(orig$newid, 4), gr = ordered(rep(c("K",
+   1:3), each = nrow(orig)), levels = c("K", 1:3)),
+   star = factor(unlist(orig[6:9])), cltype = factor(unlist(orig[10:13])),
+   schtype = factor(unlist(orig[c(14, 22, 30, 38)])),
+   hdeg = ordered(unlist(lapply(orig[c(15, 24, 32,
+   43)], as.character)), levels = c("ASSOC", "BS/BA",
+   "MS/MA/MEd", "MA+", "Ed.S", "Ed.D/Ph.D")), clad = factor(unlist(lapply(orig[c(16,
+   25, 33, 44)], as.character)), levels = c("NOT",
+   "APPR", "PROB", "PEND", "1", "2", "3")), exp = unlist(orig[c(17,
+   26, 34, 45)]), trace = factor(unlist(orig[c(18,
+   23, 31, 42)]), levels = 1:6, labels = c("W",
+   "B", "A", "H", "I", "O")), read = unlist(orig[c(19,
+   27, 35, 39)]), math = unlist(orig[c(20, 28,
+   36, 40)]), ses = factor(unlist(orig[c(21, 29,
+   37, 41)]), labels = c("F", "N")), sch = factor(unlist(orig[50:53])))

```

We can now eliminate the combinations that are completely missing. Checking

```
> summary(long)
```

| id       | gr    | star    | cltype     | schtype    |
|----------|-------|---------|------------|------------|
| 100017 : | 4     | K:11598 | 1 : 8015   | 1 : 5624   |
| 100028 : | 4     | 1:11598 | 2 : 9192   | 2 : 6428   |
| 100045 : | 4     | 2:11598 | 3 : 9589   | 3 :12561   |
| 100064 : | 4     | 3:11598 | NA's:19596 | 4 : 2183   |
| 100070 : | 4     |         |            | NA's:19596 |
| 100096 : | 4     |         |            |            |
| (Other): | 46368 |         |            |            |

  

| hdeg            | clad         | exp            | trace      |
|-----------------|--------------|----------------|------------|
| ASSOC : 0       | 1 :18303     | Min. : 0.00    | W :21550   |
| BS/BA :16586    | APPR : 2030  | 1st Qu.: 5.00  | B : 5005   |
| MS/MA/MEd: 9587 | PROB : 1961  | Median : 11.00 | A : 14     |
| MA+ : 161       | NOT : 1757   | Mean : 12.04   | H : 0      |
| Ed.S : 237      | 3 : 1059     | 3rd Qu.: 17.00 | I : 0      |
| Ed.D/Ph.D: 58   | (Other): 877 | Max. : 42.00   | O : 0      |
| NA's :19763     | NA's :20405  | NA's :19789.00 | NA's:19823 |

  

| read         | math           | ses        | sch           |
|--------------|----------------|------------|---------------|
| Min. : 315   | Min. : 288.0   | F :13111   | 51 : 826      |
| 1st Qu.: 467 | 1st Qu.: 505.0 | N :12858   | 27 : 562      |
| Median : 552 | Median : 557.0 | NA's:20423 | 9 : 543       |
| Mean : 540   | Mean : 553.7   |            | 22 : 534      |
| 3rd Qu.: 604 | 3rd Qu.: 603.0 |            | 63 : 534      |
| Max. : 775   | Max. : 774.0   |            | (Other):23797 |
| NA's :22130  | NA's :21779.0  |            | NA's :19596   |

indicates that fewest missing values are in the `sch`, `cltype`, and `schtype` columns. They are also consistent

```
> with(long, all.equal(is.na(schtype), is.na(sch)))
```

```
[1] TRUE
```

```
> with(long, all.equal(is.na(cltype), is.na(sch)))
```

```
[1] TRUE
```

hence we use these to subset the data frame

```
> long <- long[!is.na(long$sch), ]
```

It turns out that we could have used the `star` column as this simply indicates if the student was in the study that year.

```
> summary(long[1:5])
```

|          | id | gr     | star    | cltype | schtype |
|----------|----|--------|---------|--------|---------|
| 100173 : | 4  | K:6325 | 1:26796 | 1:8015 | 1: 5624 |
| 100201 : | 4  | 1:6829 | 2: 0    | 2:9192 | 2: 6428 |
| 10023 :  | 4  | 2:6840 |         | 3:9589 | 3:12561 |
| 100236 : | 4  | 3:6802 |         |        | 4: 2183 |
| 100302 : | 4  |        |         |        |         |
| 100361 : | 4  |        |         |        |         |
| (Other): |    |        |         |        | 26772   |

Because it now contains no information we will drop it.

```
> long$star <- NULL
```

For convenience we set the row names of this data frame to be a combination of the student id and the grade.

```
> rownames(long) <- paste(long$id, long$gr, sep = "/")
```

We can extract the school-level data from this table.

```
> school <- unique(long[, c("sch", "schtype")])
```

```
> length(levels(school$sch)) == nrow(school)
```

```
[1] TRUE
```

```
> row.names(school) <- school$sch
```

```
> school <- school[order(as.integer(as.character(school$sch))),  
+ ]
```

```
> long$schtype <- NULL
```

```
> levels(school$schtype) <- c("inner", "suburb", "rural",  
+ "urban")
```

```
> levels(long$cltype) <- c("small", "reg", "reg+A")
```

We can create a merged data set with

```
> star <- merge(merge(long, school, by = "sch"), student,  
+ by = "id")
```

```
> star$time <- as.integer(star$gr) - 1
```

## 5 Assigning teacher ids

There are no teacher id numbers available but we can obtain a reasonably accurate surrogate by determining the unique combinations of all the variables associated with the teacher.

```
> teacher <- unique(star[, c("cltype", "trace", "exp",
+   "clad", "gr", "hdeg", "sch")])
> teacher <- teacher[with(teacher, order(sch, gr, cltype,
+   exp, hdeg, clad, trace)), ]
```

To generate the correspondence between the observations and the teacher we create labels that incorporate the levels of each of the variables that defined the unique combinations.

```
> row.names(teacher) <- tch <- teacher$tch <- seq(nrow(teacher))
> names(tch) <- do.call("paste", c(teacher[, 1:7], list(sep = ":")))
> star$tch <- tch[do.call("paste", c(star[c("cltype",
+   "trace", "exp", "clad", "gr", "hdeg", "sch")], list(sep = ":")))]
```

We can check if this is successful by generating tables of class sizes.

```
> table(table(star$tch))

 1  2  3 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24
45  4  1  2 17 68 81 116 111 106 28 41 49 103 152 137 138
25 26 27 28 29 30 32 44 46
83 47 29 13 11  2  1  1  1

> table(table(subset(star, cltype == "small")$tch))

 1  2 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 32
12  1  2 17 68 81 114 108 100 22  9  1  1

> table(table(subset(star, cltype == "reg")$tch))

 1  2 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30
21  1  1  2  5  4 16 31 47 84 64 70 38 20 11  4  5  1

> table(table(subset(star, cltype == "reg+A")$tch))

 1  2  3 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 44 46
12  2  1  1  1  1  2 16 17 56 68 73 68 45 27 18  9  6  1  1  1
```

We see that there are three classes with sizes greater than 30 and that one of these is labelled as a “small” class. It is likely that each of these represents two or more classes but we do not have enough information to distinguish them.



## 6 Initial model fits

Some initial model fits are

```
> library(lme4)
> (mm1 <- lmer(math ~ gr + sx + eth + cltype + (1 | id) +
+ (1 | sch), star))

Linear mixed-effects model fit by REML
Formula: math ~ gr + sx + eth + cltype + (1 | id) + (1 | sch)
Data: star
      AIC      BIC logLik deviance REMLdeviance
245170 245291.6 -122570 245172.7      245140
Random effects:
Groups   Name      Variance Std.Dev.
id      (Intercept) 982.92   31.352
sch      (Intercept) 122.60   11.073
Residual                    686.62   26.203
# of obs: 24578, groups: id, 10732; sch, 80
```

```
Fixed effects:
              Estimate Std. Error    DF t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  560.49749    1.47524 24566 379.9371 < 2.2e-16
gr.L          96.41234    0.39614 24566 243.3818 < 2.2e-16
gr.Q         -4.57970    0.36384 24566 -12.5873 < 2.2e-16
gr.C         -3.46016    0.34944 24566 -9.9020 < 2.2e-16
sxF           2.95264    0.71504 24566  4.1293 3.650e-05
ethB        -22.89116    1.27486 24566 -17.9558 < 2.2e-16
ethA          2.12834    7.02898 24566  0.3028  0.76205
ethH          1.17345   10.17194 24566  0.1154  0.90816
ethI        -34.78325   14.50732 24566 -2.3976  0.01651
ethO          2.41930    8.72130 24566  0.2774  0.78147
cltypereg    -7.11133    0.72798 24566 -9.7685 < 2.2e-16
cltypereg+A  -5.91037    0.73984 24566 -7.9888 1.423e-15
```

```
> (rm1 <- lmer(read ~ gr + sx + eth + cltype + (1 | id) +
+ (1 | sch), star))
```

```
Linear mixed-effects model fit by REML
Formula: read ~ gr + sx + eth + cltype + (1 | id) + (1 | sch)
Data: star
      AIC      BIC logLik deviance REMLdeviance
241495.0 241616.4 -120732.5 241497.5      241465.0
Random effects:
Groups   Name      Variance Std.Dev.
id      (Intercept) 944.01   30.725
sch      (Intercept) 109.48   10.463
```

Residual                      692.05    26.307  
# of obs: 24226, groups: id, 10621; sch, 80

Fixed effects:

|             | Estimate  | Std. Error | DF    | t value  | Pr(> t )  |
|-------------|-----------|------------|-------|----------|-----------|
| (Intercept) | 541.70124 | 1.41601    | 24214 | 382.5550 | < 2.2e-16 |
| gr.L        | 131.40304 | 0.40070    | 24214 | 327.9338 | < 2.2e-16 |
| gr.Q        | -28.20738 | 0.36784    | 24214 | -76.6840 | < 2.2e-16 |
| gr.C        | -1.62996  | 0.35313    | 24214 | -4.6158  | 3.936e-06 |
| sxF         | 9.06081   | 0.70950    | 24214 | 12.7707  | < 2.2e-16 |
| ethB        | -18.80739 | 1.25458    | 24214 | -14.9910 | < 2.2e-16 |
| ethA        | 8.50278   | 6.93566    | 24214 | 1.2260   | 0.22023   |
| ethH        | 1.94184   | 10.04311   | 24214 | 0.1934   | 0.84669   |
| ethI        | -32.09847 | 14.36068   | 24214 | -2.2352  | 0.02542   |
| ethO        | 7.63496   | 8.61206    | 24214 | 0.8865   | 0.37533   |
| cltypereg   | -7.82802  | 0.72858    | 24214 | -10.7442 | < 2.2e-16 |
| cltypereg+A | -4.74488  | 0.74020    | 24214 | -6.4103  | 1.479e-10 |